SUCCESS FACTOR IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF TQM IN PUBLIC SERVICE AGENCIES

MAZANAH MUHAMAD
MAZALAN KAMIS
YAKCOB HJ. JANTAN
Universiti Putra Malaysia

ABSTRAK

Secara khususnya kajian ini bertujuan untuk mengetahui ciri-ciri yang membawa kepada kejayaan pelaksanaan TQM di agensi kerajaan. Kajian telah dijalankan ke atas enam buah agensi kerajaan yang menjadi calon Anugerah Kualiti Perdana Menteri. Kajian ini menggunakan kaedah penyelidikan kualitatif di mana data dikutip melalui temu duga tidak berstruktur. Dokumen yang mengandungi maklumat tentang TQM juga dikutip daripada informan dan dijadikan sebagai sumber data. Data analisis secara induktif melalui proses membentuk kategori, mengkod data dan mengkategoris data.

Kajian ini menunjukkan bahawa ciri yang membawa kejayaan dalam pelaksanaan TQM di agensi-agensi kerajaan terlibat ialah: (1) kepimpinan yang baik, (2) penglibatan dan komitmen setiap peringkat kaktangan, (3) memenuhi kepuasan pengguna, (4) penghargaan dan pengiktirafan, (5) kerja berpasukan, (6) kesedaran, dan (7) iklim organisasi yang kondusif.

Kesimpulannya, walaupun cara pelaksanaan TQM di agensi-agensi kerajaan yang dikaji didapati sejajar dengan pelaksanaan TQM di Barat dan di Jepun, namun terdapat beberapa keunikan dalam pelaksanaan TQM di agensi yang diteliti. Keunikan tersebut ialah tentang skop latihan mengenai TQM (merangkumi juga latihan keagamaan) dan keprihatinan organisasi (mengambil kira aspek budaya) terhadap kaktangan.

ABSTRACT

This study aims specifically to determine factors contributing to the success of TQM implementation in selected government agencies. A total of six
organization. Later, all efforts were merged into what is known as the implementation of TQM in the public service system (Ahmad Sarji, 1993).

The date, 11th July 1996 marked a new beginning for quality movement in the public service, for on this day the Guidelines for Implementation of MS 9000 in the Civil Service was launched by the Chief Secretary to the Government (MAMPU Online, 1999a). It was anticipated that the implementation of this standard would help towards the development of a more effective quality management system. Such a system could ensure that goods and services produced would have features that meet customer satisfaction.

A survey conducted in 1999 revealed that 229 agencies were at various stages of implementing MS ISO 9000, 13 agencies have received the MS ISO 2000 Quality System Certification while another 18 agencies have applied to MAMPU for compliance audits on their respective quality systems which are based on the MS ISO 9000 standard (MAMPU Online, 1999b). Generally, the commitment of public agencies to the implementation of MS ISO 9000 have been very encouraging. This pattern is reflected in the report of the implementation produced by MAMPU. The data shows that as of the year 2001, close to 800 agencies were involved in the implementation, with more than 200 agencies achieving the standard and had received the award (MAMPU, 2003). In view of this enthusiasm, the objective of the Government to implement MS ISO 9000 in all agencies can be achieved although it calls for a tight implementation schedule and detailed planning (MAMPU Online, 1999b).

The implementation of TQM is now in its tenth year. However, although public service agencies have already espoused the TQM concept, some questions regarding its implementation remain unanswered. This is due to the fact that certain quarters still find the concept of TQM obscure and elusive (Ho & Cheng, 1999). Noteworthy here is the fact that quality in the public sector domain, traditionally, has always been as a response to quality “problem” or failures (Donnelly, 1999). Consequently, the practitioners of TQM make numerous interpretations that naturally lead to the existence of a great variety of implementation strategies. Some see TQM as a means of increasing customer orientation, timeliness and service performance, and at the same time, reduction in costs (Berman & West, 1995), while others thought of it as an effort to dismantle the “bureaucratic” culture (Kirkpatrick & Lucio, 1995). Some criticize the quality initiatives in the public sector
fore, customer satisfaction should be the base to evaluate organizational performance (Stemple, 1993). Nonetheless, since customer satisfaction is continuously changing, henceforth efforts should be undertaken to meet this demand by continuously upgrading the quality of products and services. Such activities are very much in line with the continuous improvement concept as advocated by Deming (1986).

Factors Contributing Towards The Success of TQM

Studies have also been carried out to determine factors contributing to the successful implementation of TQM (Arvinder & Michael, 1997; Cyr, 1992; Ishikawa, 1985; Price & Chen, 1993; Shores, 1990). These authors propose various explanations on TQM reflecting diverse understanding of the concept. Cyr (1992) believes that activities in quality improvement of products and services are the pillar of TQM philosophy. There are six elements necessary to ensure success in carrying out activities of quality improvement; (1) team work, (2) leadership, (3) training, (4) cultural change, (5) full participation at all levels, and (6) recognition and rewards (Cyr, 1992).

However, Shores (1990) listed only three major elements of TQM; (1) objective, (2) strategy, and (3) system. According to Shores the objectives of TQM is to achieve customer satisfaction, while the strategy of TQM refers to activities related to quality improvement, productivity and flexibility. The last element, the system of TQM refers to the management system, total involvement, customer focus, analysis on systematic process improvement, and statistical process control.

Tenner and De Toro (1992) also listed three major components of TQM; (1) objective, (2) quality principal, and (3) supportive elements. Here, the objective of TQM is to carry out continuous quality improvement activities. While quality principles are thought to consist of components like; (1) focus, (2) quality improvement process, and (3) total involvement.

However, Price and Chen (1993) suggest that; (1) employees, (2) continuous improvement, (3) process, and (4) customers are pillars of TQM. As for Kravchuck and Leighton (1993) believe in strong managerial leadership and a hospitable administrative culture as contingent for successful implementation of TQM. However, a follow-up research by Arvinder and Michael (1997) found that the success of TQM implementation is primarily attributed to a hospitable TQM culture. On the other hand, Ishikawa (1985) suggests four components of TQM namely; (1) main objective, which is to achieve customer satisfaction, (2) focus
FINDINGS

The study found that there are seven characteristics that contribute to successful implementation of TQM in the public agencies being studied. These characteristics are: (1) leadership, (2) participation and commitment, (3) customer satisfaction, (4) rewards and recognition, (5) teamwork, (6) awareness, and (7) organizational climate.

Four informants attributed the success of TQM implementation to leadership. One informant even put the blame for the failure of an organization on leadership. The data revealed that a leader must possess qualities such as: visionary, supportive of quality improvement, committed and interested in quality efforts, provide aspirations and motivations in continuous change processes, frequently meet with his/her staff, organize study visits to other organizations, and participate in quality improvement activities.

The successful implementation of TQM also depends on the participation and commitment of all individuals. Four informants report this factor to be important. Individuals at all levels, whether they are department heads, officers or support staff, need to give their commitment and participate in quality improvement efforts. One need not be in a quality team in order to participate in quality efforts, for it can also be done by giving suggestions on quality improvements through suggestion boxes by those outside of the team. Customer participation in quality efforts is also found to be important. One agency even includes customer representatives in their quality structure and sits in the Division Board. Customer satisfaction refers to both internal and external customers. All agencies studied gives strong emphasis to customer satisfaction in their activities related to the improvement of quality. In fact, one agency rated customer satisfaction as an important factor contributing towards the successful implementation of TQM. The research also found that the customer’s charter is used as a means of communicating quality commitment of an agency to its clients.

Five agencies awarded their staff with various rewards as a means of recognizing their contribution to the respective agencies. There are awards that recognize creativity like patent award, innovation award, scientist award, and publication award. Other types of awards include: excellent service award, long service award, “good deeds” award, best staff of the month, best staff of the year, best attendance, best quality circle award, documentation system quality award, and physical health award. Interestingly, one agency was found to have
ers must be actively involved in the implementation of TQM, build commitment, generate confidence and show appreciation to subordinates. Similarly Cyr (1992) notes that the implementation of TQM requires dedicated leaders who are able to stimulate his or her workforce to embark on quality improvement activities. Without a dedicated leader, the implementation of TQM will fail miserably (Schmidt & Finnigan, 1992). Besides, leaders should also be a good role model and provide guidance for their subordinates (Matshushita, 1987).

The discovery that participation and commitment of all individuals or total involvement as important for the success of TQM implementation, is parallel to Schmidt and Finnigan's (1992) notion that every work process involves people at all levels. These people may be external or internal customers to the organization. The effort of one agency to include a customer representative in its quality structure is commendable. In fact Ishikawa (1985) had earlier suggested the scope of people to be participating in quality activities to include interested parties from outside of an organization. The concept of “Zero defect” brought about by Shingo (1985) will be difficult to achieve without participation and commitment of all interested parties (Crosby, 1979). Likewise, Deming (1986) goes a step further by suggesting that vendors be made business partners to guarantee quality.

The core of TQM is to assure customer satisfaction (Ishikawa, 1985). Shores (1990) insists that customer satisfaction is crucial for the success of a business. Businesses will be badly affected if customers are not satisfied, for they can influence the demand of a product or service (Schiller, 1991). According to Goodman et al. (1993) an organization will lose an income from one customer for every six unsatisfied customer. It is refreshing to note here that all agencies involved in this study put strong emphasis on customer satisfaction in their quality improvement activities. Efforts to satisfy the customer should not be focused only to reacting to problems or complaints of customers, but to include invigorating activities that are potentially problematic to customer (Goodman et al., 1993).

Numerous quality awards introduced by agencies involved in this study show that they are serious in recognizing the contribution of their staff towards quality improvement. Recognition and rewards can give a deep sense of satisfaction among staff members and it can be given in many forms, including monetary. That is why, according to Cyr (1992), every effort made by staff members that result in quality improvement in the implementation of TQM must be rewarded. Such moves provide proof to them that their efforts are given due recogni-
and belief systems. Various efforts to create conducive and interesting working environments show that all four dimensions of organizational climate as advocated by Taguiri have been attended to. Installing an effective communication system as part of this effort is crucial, and according to Shores (1990), a frail communication system will eventually weaken the spirit of staff members in their effort to improve quality.

One unique factor emerging from the study is the organizational concern about its staff members. Moreover, as far as providing for the welfare and facilities, these agencies go beyond the individual staff member to include family members of staff as well as the agencies’ customers. This matter is given prominence in the implementation of TQM in these agencies. Consequently, such treatment results in contentedness among staff and makes them feel proud of their organization. Such feeling is helpful towards reducing the effect of internal conflict that could prevent organizational effectiveness.

Another factor could be attributed to the local culture. According to Ismail (1988), the traditional Malay culture includes values such as kindness, humility, generosity, carefulness, uphold treaty, truthfulness, patience, helpfulness, unity, respect for parents, respect for leaders and upholding traditional customs. Mehrota (1992) who insists that beside technology, system and behavioral science, other unconventional approaches could also lead to increase in productivity. Activities such as: quality circle, workers, suggestion scheme, team work, sports and drama clubs, religious groups, canteen committee, contests and, open forums are examples of unconventional approaches. All of Mehrota’s (1992) suggestions seem to have been taken up by these public service agencies.

CONCLUSION

The success of TQM implementation in the public service agencies studied is due to good leadership quality, staff commitment, total involvement, customer satisfaction, rewards and recognition, team work, awareness of the importance of quality improvement, and conducive organizational climate. These agencies also show their concerns that go beyond the staff to include staff family members and consumers and their families. Religious values and the Malay culture have also played a pivotal role in shaping the implementation and success of TQM in public service agencies.


